

ИЗКУСТВОВЕДСКИ ЧЕТЕНИЯ

*Тематичен рецензиран годишник за изкуствознание в два тома
2017.I – Старо изкуство*

**ВИЗАНТИЙСКО
И ПОСТВИЗАНТИЙСКО ИЗКУСТВО:
ПРЕСИЧАНЕ НА ГРАНИЦИ**



**BYZANTINE
AND POST-BYZANTINE ART:
CROSSING BORDERS**

ART READINGS

*Thematic Peer-reviewed Annual in Art Studies, Volumes I–II
2017.I – Old Art*

Съставители

**Емануел Мутафов
Ида Тот**

Edited by

**Emmanuel Moutafov
Ida Toth**

София, 2018

Content

Byzantine and Post-Byzantine Art: Crossing Borders, Exploring Boundaries	11
<i>Emmanuel Moutafov, Ida Toth</i>	
Words and Images in Early Christian Inscriptions (3rd-7th Century)	39
<i>Antonio E. Felle</i>	
“Das Licht Christi leuchtet allen“ – Form und Funktion von Kreuzen mit Tetragrammen in byzantinischen und postbyzantinischen Handschriften.....	71
<i>Andreas Rhoby</i>	
Between Princes and Labourers: The Legacy of Hosios Christodoulos and his Successors in the Aegean Sea (11th-13th Centuries.)	91
<i>Angeliki Katsioti</i>	
Essay on a Visual Perspective of Medieval Writing	129
<i>Vincent Debiais</i>	
The Inner Portal of St Mark’s Basilica in Venice between East and West.....	151
<i>Valentina Cantone</i>	
Images and Texts across Time: The Three Layers of Mural Paintings in the Church of St George in Sofia.....	171
<i>Elka Bakalova, Tsvetan Vasilev</i>	
The Balkans and the Renaissance World	193
<i>Jelena Erdeljan</i>	
Panagia Eleousa in Great Prespa Lake: A symbolic artistic language at the Beginning of the 15th Century	209
<i>Melina Paissidou</i>	
Un cycle hagiographique peu étudié de la peinture extérieure moldave: La vie de saint Pacôme le Grand	231
<i>Constantin I. Ciobanu</i>	

Post-Byzantine Wall Paintings in Euboea:	
The Monastery of Panagia Peribleptos at Politika	249
<i>Andromachi Katselaki</i>	
A Unique 15th Century Donation to Vatopedi:	
A Pair of Wood-carved Lecterns	265
<i>Dimitrios Liakos</i>	
Between Loyalty, Memory and	
the Law: Byzantine and Slavic Dedicatory Church Inscriptions	
Mentioning Foreign Rulers in the 14th and 15th Centuries	303
<i>Anna Adashinskaya</i>	
The Illustrated Slavonic Miscellanies	
of Damascenes Studite's <i>Thesaurus</i> –	
a New Context for Gospel Illustrations in the Seventeenth Century	325
<i>Elissaveta Moussakova</i>	
Jovan Četirević Grabovan – an 18th-Century Itinerant Orthodox Painter.	
Some Ethnic and Artistic Considerations	349
<i>Aleksandra Kučeković</i>	
Painters of Western Training Working	
for Orthodox Patrons – Remarks on the Evidence	
of Late-medieval Transylvania (14th–15th Century)	369
<i>Dragoș Gh. Năstăsoiu</i>	
The Scene of the Road to Calvary	
in St George's Church in Veliko Tarnovo	391
<i>Maria Kolusheva</i>	
Костадин Геров-Антикаров – даскал и зограф	411
<i>Владимир Димитров</i>	
Religious and National Mythmaking:	
Conservation and Reconstruction of the Social Memory	427
<i>Antonios Tsakalos</i>	
List of Contributors	446



The Scene of the Road to Calvary in St George's Church in Veliko Tarnovo

*Maria Kolusheva*¹

*The Institute of Art Studies,
The Bulgarian Academy of Sciences*

Abstract: The study focuses on a rare iconographic type of Pilate's Escort from the scene of the Road to Calvary in the nave of St George's Church in Veliko Tarnovo. It highlights some peculiarities of the image by comparing it to a number of examples from the central region of the Balkans dating to the 15th–17th centuries. The study also includes several iconographic types of the scene that were used by icon painters at the end of the 16th and in the beginning of the 17th centuries.

Key words: post-Byzantine painting, iconography, the Road to Calvary, Pontius Pilate's scroll, Archbishopric of Ochrid, Theban painters, Monastery of Kučevište

According to the founder's inscription, the nave of St George's Church in Veliko Tarnovo was painted in 1616 by anonymous painters. The composition the Road to Calvary is located on its western wall² (Fig. 1). It represents a combination of two episodes from the

1 Maria Kolusheva has a PhD in Art History; she has worked since 2016 at the Institute of Art Studies of the Bulgarian Academy of Sciences. Her research interests include iconography, Byzantine art, post-Byzantine painting, icon-painting workshops and artistic centres in the Balkans.

2 It is signed by an inscription Ο ΕΛΚΟΜΕΝΟΣ ΕΠΙ ΣΤΑΥΡΟΥ ('led to the cross'; 'led to the Passion'). *Stefanov*, Pavel. On the Greek-Bulgarian art relations in the 17th century (based on material from St George's church in Veliko Tarnovo). – *Etudes Balkaniques*, 1992, No. 1, 91 (22); *Gergova*, Ivanka, *Penkova*, Bissierka. „Св. Георги“, Велико Търново [“Sv. Georgi”, Veliko Tarnovo]. In: Корпус на стенописите от XVII век в България [Корпус на stenopisite ot XVII vek v Balgariya]. Sofia, 2012, 59; *Kolusheva*, Mariya. Църквата „Св. Георги“ във Велико Търново и нейните стенописи [Tsarkvata “Sv. Georgi” vav Veliko Tarnovo i neynite stenopisi]. Unpublished PhD Thesis, Sofia, 2016, 87-91, ill. 44.



Gospel narrative: Christ Helkomenos and Pilate's Mounted Escort. The present study focuses on the episode of the escort led by Pontius Pilate accompanying Christ on the way to his crucifixion. In this part of the scene one of the high priests holds a scroll with a text that imitates Arabic writing (**Fig. 2**); quite an extraordinary detail, particularly considering that commonly the Roman prefect himself carries the scroll, and that its textual content reveals his account on what is happening at that particular moment.

The distinct features of the scene from the church in Veliko Tarnovo become clear in the context of the development of this particular episode in Orthodox art in the Balkans. Moreover, such an overview allows us to distinguish several iconographic types of the image that have not been the subject of study so far.

In contrast to the episode Christ Helkomenos, whose first iconographic attestations date back to the Early Christian period³, Pilate's Mounted Escort does not emerge as an element of the Christ's Passion cycle before the fourteenth century. It depicts the episode of Pilate ascending the Calvary in order to install the inscription 'Jesus of Nazareth, King of the Jews' in Hebrew, Latin and Greek (John, 19:19 – 22). This composition is believed to originate from the Quattrocento compositions of the groups of horsemen leaving the gates of Jerusalem on route to Calvary⁴. The episode emerges in Orthodox art approximately at the same time, in the mural decoration of the Dečani Monastery (1348)⁵ and the Lesnovo Monastery (1347/8)⁶. In both cases the episode of Pilate's Mounted Escort is a

3 For the typology of the scene with examples from different periods see Millet, Gabriel. *Recherches sur l'iconographie de l'évangile aux XIV^e, XV^e et XVI^e siècles d'après les monuments de Mistra, de la Macédoine et du Mont-Athos*, Paris, 1960, 362-379; *Katselaki*, Andromachi. Ο Χριστός ελκόμενος επί σταυρού. Εικονογραφία και τυπολογία της παράστασης στη βυζαντινή τέχνη (4^{ος} αι.–15^{ος} αι.). – ΔΧΑΕ, 1996–1997, No. 19, 170-181.

4 Images from the 14th and the 15th century in Western European art can be found in: *Leventis*, Antonis. Η σκηνή του εφίππου Πιλάτου στη ζωγραφική Βαλκανικών ναών (14^ο–18^ο αιώνα). – *Ηπειρωτικά Χρονικά*, 1997, No. 32, 56-62, ill. 2-9. Leventis' article includes a detailed description of the best known examples from monuments on the Balkans from the 14th–18th centuries. A great number of the images from the beginning of the 17th century, which are included in the present study, are not covered in Leventis' article. Examples of Western European painting can be found also in: *Stefanov*, Pavel. Сцената „Носене на кръста“ от наоса на църквата „Рождество Христово“ в Арбанаси [Stenata "Nosene na krasta" ot naosa na tsarkvata "Rozhdestvo Hristovo" v Arbanasi]. – *Art Studies Quarterly*, 2004, No. 3, 15-21.

5 *Kesic-Ristic*, Sanja. Циклус Христових Страдања [Ciklus Hristovih Stradanja]. In: *Зидно сликарство манастира Дечана. Грађа и студије* [Zidno slikarstvo manastira Dečana. Građa i studije]. Beograd, 1995, 127, fig. II, 55.

6 Millet, Gabriel, *Frolov*, Anatole. La peinture du Moyen Age en Yougoslavie (Serbie, Macédoine



Fig. 1. St George's Church in Veliko Tarnovo (1616). Photo: N. Haralampiev

secondary element that complements the content of the scenes from the Passion cycle, without being inextricably bound to the episode of Christ Helkomenos⁷. In these compositions Pilate, accompanied by a few Jews (most probably the high priests), is depicted in the background of the main scene, against a landscape. The image of Pilate's Escort in Lesnovo is partially damaged; on that in Dečani, however, none of the horsemen holds a scroll.

In the first century of Ottoman rule, the theme is still included in the repertory of the mural-painting workshops decorating churches on the territory of the Arch-

et Monténégro). T. III. Paris, 1963, Pl. 10, 22.

7 The episode in Dečani is Christ Refuses to Drink Vinegar with Gall; in Lesnovo it is The Road to Calvary.



Fig. 2. St George's Church in Veliko Tarnovo – a detail of the scroll

bishopric of Ochrid⁸. It is found in the following churches: Dormition of the Theotokos in Zeugostasi, in the vicinity of Kastoria (1432)⁹; St Nicholas in Vevi (1460)¹⁰; the churches of Leskovec Monastery (1461)¹¹, Dragalevtsi Monastery (1476)¹² (**Fig. 3**) and Matka Monastery (1496)¹³; and the St Nicholas Magaliou church in Kastoria (1505)¹⁴. Based on the substantial number of examples, we can assume that in this period the episode Pilate's Mounted Escort is associated with the scene Christ Helkomenos in particular. In contrast to the examples from Dečani and Lesnovo, the episode is depicted more frequently in the foreground of the composition; however, Pilate's Escort appears smaller in size than Jesus Christ and the other figures represented in the scene. This 'size deformation' of the figures is a reference to the secondary role this episode plays in the afore-mentioned monuments from the Palaiologan period, and it provides evidence for a continuity of earlier artistic tradition in the first century of Ottoman rule. Even in this early stage of the development of the scene, Pilate holds an open scroll in his hands. In both examples of the text of the scroll that survive today (in the church in Zeugostasi and in St Nicholas Magaliou), it bears the words of vindication of the Roman prefect ΑΘΩΟC ΕΙΜΙ ΕΚ ΤΟΥ ΑΙΜΑΤΟC ΤΟΥ ΔΙΚΑΙΟΥ ('I am innocent of the blood of this just person') (Matthew, 27:24). In the 16th century, the images in these churches from the territory of the Archbishopric of Ochrid serve as a model that was imitated numerous times by painters working on

8 The scene is depicted also in the Romanian monuments that have been strongly influenced by some of these paintings (Harlau, Moldovita, Dobrovat, Humor). These examples have been presented with bibliography in: *Paissidou*, Melachroini. Οι τοιχογραφίες του 17^{ου} αιώνα στους ναούς της Καστοριάς. Συμβολή στη μελέτη της μνημειακής ζωγραφικής της δυτικής Μακεδονίας. Athens, 2002, 91, ref. 604.

9 *Tsigaridas*, Euthimios. Συμβολή στη χρονολόγηση των τοιχογραφιών του ναού της Κοιμήσεως της Θεοτόκου στο Ζευγοστάσι Καστοριάς. In: Φίλια Έπη εις Γεώργιον Ε. Μυλωνάν. Τ. III. Athens, 1989, 335, ill. 83b-84a; *Sisiou*, Ioannis. Οι σκηνές των Μεγάλων Εορτών και των Παθών στο ναό της Παναγίας Ζευγοστασίου Καστοριάς. – Niš & Byzantium XIV, 2016, Niš, 409, ill. 8.

10 *Subotić*, Gojko. Οχридска сликарска школа XV века [Ohridska slikarska škola XV veka]. Beograd, 1980, fig. 70, ill. 60; *Paissidou*, Melina. The Frescoes of Agios Nikolaos at Vevi: A Landmark in the Monumental Painting of 15th Century in Western Macedonia. – Egnatia, 2007, No. 11, 120-121, fig. 7.

11 *Subotić*. Οχридска сликарска школа, fig. 79.

12 *Subotić*. Οχридска сликарска школа, ill. 86.

13 *Subotić*. Οχридска сликарска школа, fig. 112.

14 *Pelekanidis*, Stylianos. Καστορία Ι. Βυζαντινά τοιχογραφία. Πίνακες. Thessaloniki, 1953, ill. 168a,b.



Fig. 3. Church of the Theotokos in Dragalevtsi Monastery (1476). Photo: I. Vanev

commission in its diocese, as well as by those influenced directly by the tradition in this region. Such an example can be found in the work of the icon painter Ioan of Gramosta who painted the murals of St Nicholas church in the Monastery of Toplica (1536/7)¹⁵. A distinctive feature of his composition (Fig. 4) is the background of the riding horsemen, which consists of an uninterrupted line of rocky ridges, while the fortified walls of Jerusalem are not depicted at all. The text on Pilate's scroll is copied from the earlier monuments. These two features serve as the main distinguishing features of almost all paintings that can be attributed to this Ochrid-Kastorian

¹⁵ The village of Gramosta falls within the diocese of the Archbishopric of Ochrid. For the painting from Toplica see *Spahiu*, Јехона. Страдалниот циклус во црквата Свети Никола Топлички [Stradalniot ciklus vo crkvata Sveti Nikola Toplički]. – *Balcanoslavica*, 2007–2010, No. 37-39, Prilep, 53-54, ill. 6.

iconographic type. Further examples that are closest to the scene from the Monastery of Toplica are the images from Temska Monastery (1576)¹⁶ (Fig. 5) and St Petka's Church in Vukovo (1598)¹⁷. This type can be observed also in the frescoes of the following churches: in Strupetski Monastery (end of 16th c.)¹⁸; in Lomnitsa (1607/8)¹⁹; St Nicholas in Shelcan (1625)²⁰; in Riljevo, close to Prilep (1627)²¹; in the Church of the Theotokos in the Agioi Anargyroi district in Kastoria (1634)²²; and even in the monastery in Damandrio on the Island of Lesbos (second half of 16th c.)²³. The uninterrupted fortified wall that replaces the rocky landscape background in St Nicholas Church in Plati (1591)²⁴ and in the Monastery of Oreoc (1595)²⁵ suggests that the images belong to the same model, as this background is still lacking in detail and the text of the scroll remains the same²⁶.

In the second quarter of the 16th century the scene is adopted and reproduced by some of the most talented masters of post-Byzantine art together with other themes distinctive of the Ochrid-Kastorian group of monuments dating to the 15th century. These painters came from Thebes, and they executed the fresco decorations of the highly significant monuments from the region of Ioannina in Epirus; hence they are recognized in art history as members of the Epirus school²⁷.

16 This reference is based on my own observations; I could not access L. Pavlovic's monograph on the monastery: *Pavlović*, Leontije. Манастир Темска [Manastir Temska]. Smederevo, 1966.

17 *Floreva*, Elena. Средновековни стенописи. Вуково 1598 [Srednovekovni stenopisi. Vukovo 1598]. Sofia, 1987, 77-80, ill. 51.

18 *Kisjova*, Margarita. Стенописите в старата църква на Струпецкия манастир [Stenopisite v starata tsarkva na Strupetskiya manastir]. – Art Studies Quarterly, 1998, No. 4, ill. on p. 15.

19 *Ševo*, Ljiljana. Манастир Ломница [Manastir Lomnica]. Beograd, 1999, 113-114, ill. 45.

20 *Skavara*, Mariya. Το έργο των Λινοτοπιτών ζωγράφων Μιχαήλ και Κωνσταντίνου στη Νότια Αλβανία. Συμβολή στη μελέτη της μνημειακής ζωγραφικής του 17^{ου} αιώνα. Unpublished PhD Thesis, Ioannina, 2003, ill. 478.

21 The frescoes here are the work of Linotopites painters: *Tourta*, Anastasia. Οι ναοί του Αγίου Νικολάου στη Βίτσα και του Αγίου Μηνά στο Μονοδένδρι. Προσέγγιση στο έργο των ζωγράφων από το Λινοτόπι. Athens, 1991, 31-32, ill. 118a.

22 *Paissidou*. Οι τοιχογραφίες του 17^{ου} αιώνα, 96, ill. 49b.

23 *Gounaris*, Georgios. Μεταβυζαντινές τοιχογραφίες στη Λέσβο (16^{ος}-17^{ος} αι.). Athens, 1999, 67-68, ill. 49.

24 *Paissidou* Melachrini. Ζητήματα μνημειακής ζωγραφικής του 16^{ου} αιώνα από την περιοχή των Πρεσπών. In: Ζητήματα μεταβυζαντινής ζωγραφικής στη μνήμη του Μανόλη Χατζηδάκη. Athens, 2002, 188, ill. 20.

25 *Mašnić*, Mirjana. Манастирот Ореоец [Manastirot Oreoc]. Skopje, 2007, 48-49, fig. 48, ill. 20.

26 Only the text of the scroll from the church in Plati survives today.

27 There is substantial literature on these painters and their decorations. Here we will mention only *Stavropoulou-Makri*, Anghéliki. Les peintures murales de l'église de la Transfiguration à



Fig. 4. St Nicholas Church in the Monastery of Toplica (1536/7). Photo: I. Vanev



Fig. 5. St George's Church in Temska Monastery (1576). Photo: I. Vanev

In contrast, the Cretan painters who worked on Mount Athos and in the Meteora during the same period did not include this scene in their repertory. The Theban painters, on the other hand, paid special attention to the depiction of Pilate's Escort. In some of their fresco programmes, this episode's role becomes equally important to that of the remaining scenes from the cycle, and it is framed separately from the composition Christ Helkomenos²⁸. The Theban painters added new elements to the iconographical scheme of the episode – its main feature becomes a back-facing Pilate heading the group of horsemen²⁹. Another typical feature of the Epirus model are the fortress gates, which are given a prominent place in the composition. Without exception, one of the horsemen and his horse is depicted at the precise moment of exiting the Jerusalem fortress, in some instances as viewed from the side, and in others – from a frontal point of view³⁰. Another distinctive feature of these images is the content of the scroll held by Pilate. The words inscribed on it are a precise visualization of the testimony in the Gospel of John (19:17 – 22). Thus in the scenes painted by members of the Epirus school we read the following: ΙΗCOYC NAZΩΠΑΙΟC BACIΛEYC TΩN IOYΔEΩN³¹. In the composition from the Monastery of St Nicholas ton Philanthropinon³², the two lines following the common text in Greek – ό βασιλεύ[ς] τῶν Ἰ[ου]δαίων, – are filled with undecipher-

Veltsista (1568) en Epire et l'atelier des peintres Kondaris. Ιωάννινα, 1989. *Acheimastou-Potamianou*, Myrtali. Ζητήματα μνημειακής ζωγραφικής του 16^{ου} αιώνα. Η τοπική ηπειρωτική σχολή. – ΔΧΑΕ, 1992, No. 16, Athens, 1992, 13-32; *Acheimastou-Potamianou*, Myrtali. Οι τοιχογραφίες της μονής των Φιλανθρωπητών στο νησί των Ιωαννίνων. Athens, 2004.

28 As is done in the following monasteries: St Nicholas Dilios and Eleusa in Ioannina, Varlaam in Meteora, Transfiguration in Veltsista (present-day Klimatia).

29 This feature is mentioned by A. Karamperidi in her dissertation on Pateron Monastery; see *Karamperidi*, Argyro. Η Μονή Πατέρων και η ζωγραφική του 17^{ου} αιώνα στην περιοχή της Ζίτσας Ιωαννίνων. Unpublished PhD Thesis, Ioannina, 2006, 160, ref. 1144, 1145.

30 For example in the Monastery of St Nicholas of Philanthropinon: *Acheimastou-Potamianou*, Myrtali. Η μονή των Φιλανθρωπητών και η πρώτη φάση της μεταβυζαντινής ζωγραφικής. Athens, 1983, 83-86, ill. 10b, 54; or in St Nicholas Dilios Monastery: *Liva-Xanthaki*, Theopisti. Οι τοιχογραφίες της Μονής Ντίλιου. Ioannina, 1980, 69-72, ill. 29.

31 With insignificant variation this text is found in the monasteries of Philanthropinon, St Nicholas Dilios, Transfiguration in Veltsista, Varlaam in Meteora and in the church of St Demetrios in Veltsista; see *Acheimastou-Potamianou*. Η μονή των Φιλανθρωπητών, 85, ref. 647. The scroll from St Demetrios Church in Veltsista has not been published – our observations come from field research.

32 On dating the murals in the nave see the interpretations of *Acheimastou-Potamianou*. Η μονή των Φιλανθρωπητών, 21-34, as well as of *Semoglou*, Athanasios. Ο εντοίχιος διάκοσμος του καθολικού της Μονής Μυρτιάς στην Αιτωλία (φάση του 1539) και η θέση του στη ζωγραφική του Α' μισού του 16^{ου} αιώνα. – Egnatia, 2001–2002, No. 6, Thessaloniki, 185-238.



Fig. 6. Nave of the catholicon of the Varlaam Monastery, Meteora (1548). Photo: I. Vanev

able symbols, which – according to M. Acheimastou-Potamianou who has studied the monument, – probably represent the additional inscriptions in Latin and Hebrew that the Evangelist mentions³³. The same detail is present also in the Varlaam Monastery in Meteora (1548)³⁴ (Fig. 6).

The influence of this new iconographical model is already evident in the art of some painters after the middle of the 16th century, for example in the frescoes in St Athanasius (St. Nicholas) Church in Šiševo (1565), produced by an anonymous painter³⁵. A rare example

33 Acheimastou-Potamianou. Η μονή των Φιλανθρωπητών, 85, ref. 647.

34 There is still no monograph on this monument, a true representative of the art of the Theban painters.

35 J. Novakovic does not mention this scene in her article on the work of the artistic workshop that has produced the frescoes; see *Nikolić-Novaković*, Jasminka. Црквата во Градовци и една сликарска работилница од втората половина на XVI век во околината на Скопје [Crkvata vo Gradovci i edna slikarska rabotilnica od vtorata polovina na XVI vek vo okolinata na Skopje].



Fig. 7. Dormition of the Virgin Church in the village of Priboy, Pernik Province (17th century). Photo: I. Vanev

of the distribution of the ‘Epirus type’ in the Bulgarian lands is the image from the church of the Dormition of the Virgin in the village of Priboy (17th c.)³⁶ (**Fig. 7**). Painters from some of the workshops, originating from the village of Linotopi, also adhere closely to the elaborate artistic style of the Theban master painters. For example, a certain Michael and his son Constantine consecutively ran a workshop that was active for a long period in the region of Epirus³⁷ (**Fig. 8**).

To summarize, we can distinguish two main iconographical types of the episode of Pilate’s Mounted Escort in the Central Balkan

– Kulturno nasledstvo, 1997, No. 22-23, Skopje, 91-107. For the image see *Vasileski, Aleksandar*. Св. Атанасиј (Св. Никола), с. Шишево [Sv. Atanasij (Sv. Nikola), s. Šiševo]. In: E. Dimitrova, V. Lilčić, K. Antevska, A. Vasileski (eds.). Матка. Културно наследство [Matka. Kulturno nasledstvo]. Skopje, 2011, ill. on p. 240, 242.

³⁶ *Penkova, Bisserka*. „Успение Богородично“, Прибой [“Uspenie Bogorodichno”, Priboy]. In: Корпус на стенописите от XVII век в България [Korpus na stenopisite ot XVII vek v Balgariya]. Sofia, 2012, 203-205, ill. on p. 205.

³⁷ The main scholarly work on the painters is the following book: *Tourta*. Οι ναοί του Αγίου Νικολάου στη Βίτσα, as well as the newer study by *Tsampouras, Theocharis*. Τα καλλιτεχνικά εργαστήρια από την περιοχή του Γράμμου κατά τον 16^ο και 17^ο αιώνα. Ζωγράφοι από το Λινότοπι, την Γράμμοστα, τη Ζέρμα και το Μπουρμπουτσικό. Unpublished PhD Thesis, Thessaloniki, 2013. For examples from the region, painted by members of the workshop, see *Karamperidi*. Η Μονή Πατέρων, 159-161, ill. 116, 272, 238.



Fig. 8. St Nicholas Church in Vitsa, Epirus (1612) (An. Tourta)

Peninsula in the post-Byzantine period: the first is used mostly by painters working on the territory of the Archbishopric of Ochrid; the second is the version created by the Theban painters and subsequently recreated far outside the borders of Epirus.

In comparison with the preceding period, the end of the 16th and the beginning of the 17th century was a time when many painters' workshops were active and productive. Quite often they did not sign their work. The problem of their identification is complicated further by the syncretism of their painting style: in their repertoire the same painters include models that were used by different

schools from the middle of the 16th century, together with the preceding models from the end of the 15th century, as well as from the Palaiologan period. In such a complex environment the typology of the scene that is suggested in the current study could contribute for determining the origin of the painters that worked on a particular fresco programme. In combination with a number of other iconographic features this typology could serve as one of the markers, hinting at the place where the painters received their education, or indicating the region where they were hired most frequently.

Could the image from St George's Church in Veliko Tarnovo belong to one of the two iconographical types mentioned earlier? And what would that association reveal about the origin or the place of education of the painters that worked in Tarnovo in 1616? In the scene, recreated by the painters in St George, the body of the last horse from the escort is depicted halfway through the gates of the Fortress of Jerusalem – a feature that is typical for the Epirus school. At the same time, Pilate is not facing backwards; this sets the image apart from this iconographical type, and makes it more similar to the Ochrid model. There is another detail that is not found in either of the aforementioned models: the scroll – traditionally held by Pilate – is in the hands of one of the high priests. Even more extraordinarily, the text on the scroll does not correspond with either version; the scroll from the church in Veliko Tarnovo contains symbols that are neither Cyrillic nor Greek, with elements and lexemes in Arabic; these, however, do not form a coherent text³⁸. It should be noted that this is not a case of Pseudo-Kufic ornamentation, as the purpose of the scrolls is to convey particular information; in other words, in their essence they have semantic value (even when their content is unclear, as is the case here), whereas Kufesque in Christian art has a mainly decorative function³⁹.

An earlier example of imitated text on Pilate's scroll can be found

38 My deepest gratitude goes to Dr Anka Stoilova, archivist-Arabist at the Oriental Collections Department of Sts Cyril and Methodius National Library for her help with the inscription. We could presume that the painters are familiar with examples of Arabic writing, they can imitate it but they are hardly transcribing an existing text. Besides, there are some elements from the Greek writing on the scroll.

39 On this topic see: *Orlova, Maria*. О некоторых декоративных приемах в стенописи собора Рождества Богоматери Антониева монастыря в Новгороде (1125) [О nekotorykh dekorativnykh priyemakh v stenopisi sobora Rozhdestva Bogomateri Antoniyeva monastyrja v Novgorode (1125)]. – *Art Studies Quarterly*, 2010, No. 1, 3-11.



Fig. 9. Holy Archangels Church in the Monastery of Kučevište (1591) (An. Serafimova)



Fig. 10. Detail of the scroll from the Monastery of Kučevište

on the frescoes in Yashunski Monastery St John the Baptist (1524) in the vicinity of Niš⁴⁰; however, in iconographical terms the episode of Pilate's Escort there differs from all images known at present, so it will not be discussed here. The closest parallel to the scene from Veliko Tarnovo can be found in the Monastery of the Holy Archangels in the vicinity of Kučevište (1591)⁴¹ (Fig. 9). Here the scroll is once again held by one of the horsemen, and its inscription is an imitation of text (Fig. 10); the last of the horsemen, coming out of the fortress, is depicted only halfway visible passing through the gate. Certain similarities with these images can be found also in the scenes from Pustinja Monastery (1622)⁴², as well as in Monastery of the Holy Apostles in the Patriarchate of Peć (1633/4)⁴³; hypothetically, they could also be ascribed to this peculiar type.

It is not easy to interpret the painter's decision to fill the scroll with an imitation of Arabic writing. The fact that the painters in Veliko Tarnovo – who beyond doubt spoke Greek, – omitted the Greek text that is present in the scene from the Philanthropinon Monastery, as well as from the Varlaam Monastery, reveals that this is not a modification of the Epirus model of Pilate's Escort. Furthermore, in the scene from Veliko Tarnovo – same as in the scene from Kučevište, – the scroll is not in Pilate's hands but in those of one of the horsemen from the escort, i.e. the meaning of the text must be different both from Pilate's vindication (in the Ochrid-Kastorian type), as well as from the depiction of the Gospel narrative (in the Epirus type). We believe that the unique iconographic similarities between the images in the two churches suggest the existence of a common model that was rarely used in the post-Byzantine period on the Balkans.

According to the scholar Aneta Serafimova – who studies the Monastery of Kučevište – the authors of the frescoes in the nave were

40 No special research has been carried out on this monudent, and the image has not been published. The scene is extraordinary also because the episode Pilate's Escort has been added to the scene Crucifixion, and not the scene The Road to Calvary. For some information about the monastery and the frescoes see *Rakocija*, Miša. Јашуњски манастир Св. Јована [Jašunjski manastir Sv. Jovana.]. In: Манастири и цркве јужне и источне Србије [Manastiri i crkve južne i istočne Srbije]. Niš, 2013, 113-115.

41 *Serafimova*, Aneta. Кучевишки манастир Свети Архангели [Kučeviški manastir Sveti Arhangeli]. Skopje, 2005, 82-83, ill. 26, 28.

42 *Pejić*, Svetlana. Манастир Пустинја [Manastir Pustinja]. Beograd, 2002, 108-9, ill. 77.

43 *Durić*, Vojislav. *Ćirković*, Sima. *Korać*, Vojislav. Пећка патријаршија [Pečka patrijaršija]. Beograd, 1990, 294, ill. 190.

educated on the territory of the Archbishopric of Ochrid⁴⁴. She believes that this scene in particular follows the ‘Kastorian model’, and its closest iconographic parallels can be found in the church of St Athanasius (St Nicholas) in Šiševo (1565), and in St Nicholas Šiševski Monastery (1630)⁴⁵. As we have demonstrated, both suggestions are inconclusive.

The clarification of the main iconographical models of the scene and thence the specification of the type, used in St George’s Church in Veliko Tarnovo, aimed to take us one step closer to identifying the origin of the painters who worked here. The general study of the painting style, used in the church,⁴⁶ led us to the suggestion that the painters were most frequently hired from Thessaly, as their iconographical repertory was influenced most prominently by the mural decorations in the region attributed to the famous Dzordzis from Crete⁴⁷. But this scene is not observed either in the repertory of the Cretan painters, or in that of Dzordzis. However, this can only partially account for its divergences from the two main types. The unusual iconography of the episode, along with a few other distinctive features of the repertory of the painters working in Veliko Tarnovo⁴⁸, provide evidence that the latter followed models that are not typical for the Balkans; their origin – as well as their authors’ – is yet to be determined and clarified.

44 *Serafimova*. Кучевишки манастир, 306.

45 *Serafimova*. Кучевишки манастир, 83. The painting from the Monastery of Šiševo has not been published.

46 *Kolusheva*. Църквата „Св. Георги“, 188.

47 Several fresco paintings from Thessaly are also attributed to Dzordzis from Crete and members of his workshop, besides their works on Mount Athos – namely, the main churches of the monasteries of Metamorphosis (The Great Meteoron) (1552) and Roussanou (1560) in Meteora, as well as St Vissarion Monastery (Doussikou) (1557) in the vicinity of Trikala. A detailed bibliography about research on Dzordzis’ work can be found in: *Perrakis*, Ioannis. Συγκριτικές εικονογραφικές παρατηρήσεις στα έργα του Θεοφάνη και του εργαστηρίου του Τζώρτζη, σε παραστάσεις του Χριστολογικού κύκλου. In: Ανταπόδοση. Μελέτες βυζαντινής και μεταβυζαντινής αρχαιολογίας και τέχνης προς τιμήν της καθηγήτριας Ελένης Δελιγιάννη-Δωρή. Athens, 2010, 370, ref. 2. See also: *Anagnostopoloulos*, Aleksandros. Οι τοιχογραφίες του καθολικού της Μονής Ρουσαίου των Μετεώρων. Unpublished PhD Thesis, Thessaloniki, 2010.

48 *Kolusheva*. Църквата „Св. Георги“, 244.

Bibliography

Acheimastou-Potamianou, Myrtali. Η μονή των Φιλανθρωπητών και η πρώτη φάση της μεταβυζαντινής ζωγραφικής. Athens, 1983.

Acheimastou-Potamianou, Myrtali. Ζητήματα μνημειακής ζωγραφικής του 16^{ου} αιώνα. Η τοπική ηπειρωτική σχολή. – ΔΧΑΕ [Δελτίον της Χριστιανικής Αρχαιολογικής Εταιρείας], 1992, No. 16, Athens, 13-32.

Acheimastou-Potamianou, Myrtali. Οι τοιχογραφίες της μονής των Φιλανθρωπητών στο νησί των Ιωαννίνων. Athens, 2004.

Anagnostopoulos, Aleksandros. Οι τοιχογραφίες του καθολικού της Μονής Ρουσάνου των Μετεώρων. Unpublished PhD Thesis, Thessaloniki, 2010.

Floreva, Elena. Средновековни стенописи. Вуково 1598 [Srednovekovni stenopisi. Vukovo 1598]. Sofia, 1987.

Gergova, Ivanka, Penkova, Biserka. „Св. Георги“, Велико Търново [“Sv. Georgi“, Veliko Tarnovo]. In: Корпус на стенописите от XVII век в България [Korpus na stenopisite ot XVII vek v Balgariya]. Sofia, 2012, 58-66.

Gounaris, Georgios. Μεταβυζαντινές τοιχογραφίες στη Λέσβο (16^{ος}–17^{ος} αι.). Athens, 1999.

Karamperidi, Argyro. Η Μονή Πατέρων και η ζωγραφική του 17^{ου} αιώνα στην περιοχή της Ζίτσας Ιωαννίνων. Unpublished PhD Thesis, Ioannina, 2006.

Katselaki, Andromachi. Ο Χριστός ελκόμενος επί σταυρού. Εικονογραφία και τυπολογία της παράστασης στη βυζαντινή τέχνη (4^{ος} αι. – 15^{ος} αι.). – ΔΧΑΕ [Δελτίον της Χριστιανικής Αρχαιολογικής Εταιρείας], 1996-1997, No. 19, Athens, 170-181.

Kesić-Ristić, Sanja. Циклус Христових Страдања [Ciklus Hristovih Stradanja]. In: Зидно сликарство манастира Дечана. Грађа и студије [Zidno slikarstvo manastira Dečana. Građa i studije]. Beograd, 1995, 121-130.

Kisyova, Margarita. Стенописите в старата църква на Струпецкия манастир [Stenopisite v starata tsarkva na Strupetskiya manastir]. – Art Studies Quarterly, 1998, No. 4, Sofia, 12-19.

Kolusheva, Mariya. Църквата „Св. Георги“ във Велико

Търново и нейните стенописи [Tsarkvata „Sv. Georgi“ vav Veliko Tarnovo i neynite stenopisi]. Unpublished PhD Thesis, Sofia, 2016.

Leventis, Antonis. Η σκηνή του εφίππου Πιλάτου στη ζωγραφική Βαλκανικών ναών (14 – 18 αιώνα). – *Ηπειρωτικά Χρονικά*, 1997, No. 32, Ioannina, 51-112.

Liva-Xanthaki, Theopisti. Οι τοιχογραφίες της Μονής Ντίλιου. Ioannina, 1980.

Mašnić, Mirjana. Манастирот Ореоец [Manastirot Oreoc]. Skopje, 2007.

Millet, Gabriel. *Frolow, Anatole.* La peinture du Moyen Age en Yougoslavie (Serbie, Macédoine et Monténégro). T. III. Paris, 1963.

Millet, Gabriel. Recherches sur l'iconographie de l'évangile aux XIV^e, XV^e et XVI^e siècles d'après les monuments de Mistra, de la Macédoine et du Mont-Athos, Paris, 1960.

Nikolić-Novaković, Jasminka. Црквата во Градовци и една сликарска работилница од втората половина на XVI век во околината на Скопје [Crkvata vo Gradovci i edna slikarska rabotilnica od vtorata polovina na XVI vek vo okolinata na Skopje]. – *Kulturno nasledstvo*, 1997, No. 22-23, Skopje, 91-107.

Orlova, Maria. О некоторых декоративных приемах в стенописи собора Рождества Богоматери Антониева монастыря в Новгороде (1125) [O nekotorykh dekorativnykh priyemakh v stenopisi sobora Rozhdestva Bogomateri Antoniyeva monastyrya v Novgorode (1125)]. – *Art Studies Quarterly*, 2010, No. 1, Sofia, 3-11.

Paissidou, Melachorini. Οι τοιχογραφίες του 17^{ου} αιώνα στους ναούς της Καστοριάς. Συμβολή στη μελέτη της μνημειακής ζωγραφικής της δυτικής Μακεδονίας. Athens, 2002.

Paissidou, Melachroini. Ζητήματα μνημειακής ζωγραφικής του 16^{ου} αιώνα από την περιοχή των Πρεσπών. In: Ζητήματα μεταβυζαντινής ζωγραφικής στη μνήμη του Μανόλη Χατζηδάκη. Athens, 2002, 179-201.

Paissidou, Melina. The Frescoes of Agios Nikolaos at Vevi: a Landmark in the Monumental Painting of 15th Century in Western Macedonia. – *Egnatia*, 2007, No. 11, Thessaloniki, 113-128.

Pavlović, Leontije. Манастир Темска [Manastir Temska].

Smederevo, 1966.

Penkova, Bissarka. „Успение Богородично“, Прибой [“Uspenie Bogorodichno”, Priboy]. In: Корпус на стенописите от XVII век в България [Korpus na stenopisite ot XVII vek v Balgariya]. Sofia, 2012, 203-205.

Pejić, Svetlana. Манастир Пустиња [Manastir Pustinja]. Beograd, 2002.

Pelekanidis, Stylianos. Καστοριά Ι, Βυζαντινά τοιχογραφία. Πίνακες. Thessaloniki, 1953.

Perrakis, Ioannis. Συγκριτικές εικονογραφικές παρατηρήσεις στα έργα του Θεοφάνη και του εργαστηρίου του Τζώρτζη, σε παραστάσεις του Χριστολογικού κύκλου. In: Ανταπόδοση. Μελέτες βυζαντινής και μεταβυζαντινής αρχαιολογίας και τέχνης προς τιμήν της καθηγήτριας Ελένης Δελιγιάννη-Δωρή. Athens, 2010, 369-392.

Rakocija, Miša. Јашуњски манастир Св. Јована [Jašunjski manastir Sv. Jovana.]. In: Манастири и цркве јужне и источне Србије [Manastiri i crkve južne i istočne Srbije]. Niš, 2013, 113-115.

Serafimova, Aneta. Кучевишки манастир Свети Архангели [Kučeviški manastir Sveti Arhangeli]. Skopje, 2005.

Semoglou, Athanasios. Ο εντοίχιος διάκοσμος του καθολικού της Μονής Μυρτιάς στην Αιτωλία (φάση του 1539) και η θέση του στη ζωγραφική του Α΄ μισού του 16^{ου} αιώνα. – Egnatia, 2001–2002, No. 6, Thessaloniki, 185-238.

Sisiou, Ioannis. Οι σκηνές των Μεγάλων Εορτών και των Παθών στο ναό της Παναγίας Ζευγοστασίου Καστοριάς. – Niš & Byzantium XIV, 2016, Niš, 395-418.

Skavara, Mariya. Το έργο των Λινοτοπιτών ζωγράφων Μιχαήλ και Κωνσταντίνου στη Νότια Αλβανία. Συμβολή στη μελέτη της μνημειακής ζωγραφικής του 17^{ου} αιώνα. Unpublished PhD Thesis, Ioannina, 2003.

Sprahiu, Jehona. Страдалниот циклус во црквата Свети Никола Топлички [Stradalniot ciklus vo crkvata Sveti Nikola Toplički]. – Balcanoslavica, 2007–2010, No. 37-39, Prilep, 46-67.

Stavropoulou-Makri, Anghéliki. Les peintures murales de l'église de la Transfiguration à Veltsista (1568) en Epire et l'workshop des peintres Kondaris. Ioannina, 1989.

Stefanov, Pavel. On the Greek-Bulgarian art relations in the 17th century (based on material from St George's church in Ve-

liko Tarnovo). – Etudes Balkaniques, 1992, No. 1, Sofia, 86-99.

Stefanov, Pavel. Сцената „Носене на кръста“ от наоса на църквата „Рождество Христово“ в Арбанаси [Stsenata “Nosene na krasta” ot naosa na tsarkvata “Rozhdestvo Hristovo” v Arbanasi] – Art Studies Quarterly, 2004, No. 3, Sofia, 15-21.

Subotić, Gojko. Охридска сликарска школа XV века [Ohrid-ska slikarska škola XV veka]. Beograd, 1980.

Tourta, Anastasia. Οι ναοί του Αγίου Νικολάου στη Βίτσα και του Αγίου Μηνά στο Μονοδένδρι. Προσέγγιση στο έργο των ζωγράφων από το Λινοτόπι. Athens, 1991.

Tsampouras, Theocharis. Τα καλλιτεχνικά εργαστήρια από την περιοχή του Γράμμου κατά τον 16^ο και 17^ο αιώνα. Ζωγράφοι από το Λινοτόπι, την Γράμμοστα, τη Ζέρμα και το Μπουρμπουτσικό. Unpublished PhD Thesis, Thessaloniki, 2013.

Tsigaridas, Eythimios. Συμβολή στη χρονολόγηση των τοιχογραφιών του ναού της Κοιμήσεως της Θεοτόκου στο Ζευγοστάσι Καστοριάς. In: Φίλια Έπη εις Γεώργιον Ε. Μυλωνάν. Τ. III, 1989, Athens, 332-338.

Vasileski, Aleksandar. Св. Атанасиј (Св. Никола), с. Шишево [Sv. Atanasij (Sv. Nikola), s. Šiševo]. In: E. Dimitrova, V. Lilčić, K. Antevska, A. Vasileski (eds.). Матка. Културно наследство [Matka. Kulturno nasledstvo]. Skorje, 2011, 233-241.

Đurić, Vojislav, Ćirković, Sima, Korać, Vojislav. Пећка патријаршија [Pećka patrijaršija]. Beograd, 1990.

Ševo, Ljiljana. Манастир Ломница [Manastir Lomnica]. Beograd, 1999.

Сцената Пътят към Голгота от църквата „Св. Георги“ във Велико Търново

Мария Колушева



В наоса на църквата „Св. Георги“ във В. Търново (1616) е представен популярният в поствизантийското изкуство епизод на Конницата на Пилат като част от сцената Пътят към Голгота. В текста е обърнато внимание на няколко интересни иконографски детайла от изображението, които го отличават от повечето известни примери от периода. За да бъдат открити по-ясно особеностите на епизода от търновската църква, в изследването са набелязани два основни иконографски типа на сцената, използвани от зографите в края на XVI и началото на XVII в., които досега не са били предмет на специално проучване. Единият от тях е утвърден в Охридско-костурския регион през XV и XVI в., а другият е разработка на зографите, изпълнили стенописите на редица важни църкви и манастири в района на Епир през XVI в. Вариантът, представен в църквата „Св. Георги“ в Търново, не съвпада с нито един от разгледаните иконографски типове. Най-близък негов паралел е известен от църквата на Кучевишкия манастир (1591). Сходствата между двете изображения показват съществуването на общ модел, рядко прилаган през поствизантийския период на Балканите. Заедно с още няколко характерни особености в репертоара на зографите, работили в Търново, той е свидетелство за следването на редки за Балканите модели, чийто произход все още не е установен и предстои да бъде изясняван.

List of Contributors

Andreas Rhoby, Ph.D, Associate Professor,
University of Vienna (Austria)
andreas.rhoby@oeaw.ac.at

Andromachi Katselaki, Ph.D,
Ministry of Culture and Sports (Greece)
archanes1315@yahoo.gr

Angeliki Katsioti, Ph.D,
Ephorate of Antiquities of the Dodecanese,
Head of the Department of Byzantine and Post-Byzantine Sites,
Monuments, Research and Museums (Greece)
gelikatsioti@gmail.com

Antonio Enrico Felle, Ph.D, Professor,
University "Aldo Moro", Bari (Italy)
ae.felle@gmail.com

Aleksandra Kučeković, Ph.D, Associate Professor,
University of Arts, Belgrade (Serbia)
akucekovic@gmail.com

Anna Adashinskaya, Ph.D Student,
Department of Medieval Studies of Central European
University in Budapest (Hungary)
adashik@gmail.com

Antonis Tsakalos, Ph.D, Curator,
Byzantine and Christian Museum, Athens (Greece)
antonistsakalos@gmail.com

Constantin I. Ciobanu, Dsc.,
Institute of Art History "G. Oprescu", Bucharest (Romania)
constantini_ciobanu@yahoo.com

Dimitrios Liakos, Ph.D,
Ephorate of Antiquities of Chalkidiki and Mt. Athos,
Ministry of Culture and Sports (Greece)
liakos712003@yahoo.gr

Dragoş Gh. Năstăsoiu, Ph.D Student,
Medieval Studies at the Central European University
in Budapest (Hungary)
dragos_nastasoiu@yahoo.com

Elka Bakalova, Corresponding Member of the BAS,
Institute of Art Studies, Sofia (Bulgaria)
elkabakalova@gmail.com

Elissaveta Moussakova, Ph.D, Professor,
Institute of Art Studies, Sofia (Bulgaria)
emoussakova@gmail.com

Emmanuel Moutafov, Ph.D, Associate Professor,
Institute of Art Studies, Sofia (Bulgaria)
moutafov1@gmail.com

Ida Toth, Ph.D, Senior Lecturer,
Oxford University (United Kingdom)
ida.toth@history.ox.ac.uk

Jelena Erdeljan, Ph.D, Associate Professor,
University of Belgrade (Serbia)
jerdelja@f.bg.ac.rs

Maria Kolousheva, Ph.D, Assistant Professor,
Institute of Art Studies, Sofia (Bulgaria)
m.kolusheva@gmail.com

Melina Paissidou, Ph.D, Associate Professor,
Aristotle University of Thessaloniki (Greece),
mpaisidou@hist.auth.gr

Tsvetan Vasilev, Ph.D, Assistant Professor,
Sofia University (Bulgaria)
cvetanv@gmail.com

Valentina Cantone, Ph.D, Adjunct Professor,
University of Padua, Department of Cultural Heritage (Italy)
valentina.cantone@unipd.it

Vladimir Dimitrov, Ph.D, Assistant Professor,
New Bulgarian University, Sofia (Bulgaria)
vladimirdim@gmail.com

Vincent Debiais, Ph.D, full researcher,
Centre national de la recherche scientifique (France),
Centre d'études supérieures de civilisation médiévale,
University of Poitiers (France)
vincent.debiais@univ-poitiers.fr

Изкуствоведски четения 2017

Art Readings 2017

**ВИЗАНТИЙСКО И
ПОСТВИЗАНТИЙСКО ИЗКУСТВО:
ПРЕСИЧАНЕ НА ГРАНИЦИ**

**BYZANTINE AND
POST-BYZANTINE ART:
CROSSING BORDERS**

Институт за изследване на изкуствата, БАН

Institute of Art Studies, BAS

съставители
Емануел Мутафов
Ида Тот (Великобритания)

Edited by
Emmanuel Moutafov
Ida Toth (United Kingdom)



отговорен редактор
Тереза Бачева

Copy-editor
Tereza Bacheva

превод
Милена Лилова
Светлана Лазарова

Translation
Milena Lilova
Svetlana Lazarova

коректори
Андрю Смол (Оксфордски университет)
Хю Джефри (Оксфордски университет)

Proofreaders
Andrew Small (University of Oxford)
Hugh Jeffrey (University of Oxford)

предпечат
Любомир Маринчевски
Майа Лачева

Content Management
Lyubomir Marinchevski
Maya Lacheva

печат
Дайрект сървисиз

Press
Direct Services

ISBN 978-954-8594-70-7
ISSN 1313-2342

ISBN 978-954-8594-70-7
ISSN 1313-2342